

Inclusive and Equitable Teaching – ACUE Curriculum Crosswalk

Introduction

Less than half of the nation’s 17 million postsecondary students will graduate within a typical timeframe. Completion rates are even lower among first generation, low-income, and students of color. Although 60% of White women and Asian American men and women between the ages of 25 and 34 will hold a degree or credential by 2020, a recent study by the Educational Testing Service (ETS) found that African American women are not projected to meet this goal until 2058. Through 2060—the furthest date the Census Bureau makes projections—African American and Hispanic men and women will not reach the 60% goal.¹ Left unchanged, these figures confirm deep inequities that belie our faith in education as an engine of mobility and opportunity.

In response, higher education has embraced a multi-faceted “student success” agenda. Reforms aim to make higher education more accessible, affordable, and easier to navigate. Many interventions are deployed outside of the classroom, such as intensive advising and supplemental instruction. But the achievement trends identified by ETS suggest that alone, such changes and interventions are insufficient.

To promote more equitable outcomes, it is necessary to strengthen the core of the collegiate experience: teaching and learning. This directive was voiced by the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, in its landmark report *The Future of Undergraduate Education, the Future of America* and its compendium paper “Policies and Practices to Support Undergraduate Teaching Improvement.”² The Academy’s recommendations also acknowledge that most of the country’s 1.5 million professors have little to no formal preparation and comprehensive preparation in effective teaching methods that create inclusive learning environments.

Inclusive Teaching

Inclusive teaching practices help all students’ learn, but are “especially beneficial to students who are members of groups underrepresented in their fields or traditionally underserved by institutions of higher education,” notes the Center for Teaching and Assessment of Learning at the University of Delaware, a recipient of the 2018 Higher Education Excellence in Diversity Award.³ Such teaching approaches ensure that all

¹ Nettles, M. T. (2017). Challenges and opportunities in achieving the national postsecondary degree attainment goals. ETS Research Report Series. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ets2.12141>

²“The Future of Undergraduate Education, the Future of America,” American Academy of Arts & Sciences, Cambridge, MA, 2017. <https://www.amacad.org/cfue>; Pallas, A., A Neumann, and C. Campbell, “Policies and Practices to Support Undergraduate Teaching Improvement,” American Academy of Arts & Sciences, Cambridge, MA, 2017.

³<https://ctal.udel.edu/resources-2/inclusive-teaching/> (retrieved January 15, 2020); Hall, C. “UD Received the 2018 Higher Education Excellence in Diversity Award,” University of Delaware, Sept. 2018, <https://www.udel.edu/udaily/2018/september/excellence-diversity-inclusion-award/>.

students are supported to “freely learn and explore new ideas [and] feel safe to express their views in a civil manner and respected as individuals and members of groups.” The University of Michigan’s Center for Research on Learning and Teaching similarly explains that inclusive teaching occurs when faculty “deliberately cultivate a learning environment where all students are treated equitably, have equal access to learning, and feel welcome, valued, and supported in their learning [and] attend to social identities.”⁴

Stronger Outcomes, Greater Equity

Independently validated research conducted by ACUE, its partner institutions, and third-party evaluators demonstrates that students are more engaged, earn better grades, and complete courses in greater numbers—*more equitably with their peers*—when taught by ACUE-credentialed faculty.⁵ Recent studies have shown:

- **Gap closed for African American students:** At Texas Woman’s University (TWU), ACUE-credentialed faculty closed the course completion gap for African American students in 113 classes with 1,800 students, in a study conducted by ACUE and TWU.
- **Equity achieved:** Cal State LA eliminated the achievement gap between Pell-eligible and other students, with annual 25% increases in completion, by transforming developmental mathematics with ACUE-credentialed faculty, as found in analyses conducted and presented by Cal State LA.
- **Success rate and growth mindset up, DFWs down:** At Delta State University in Cleveland Mississippi—where ninety-seven percent of students depend on federal, state and local aid⁶—more students earned As, Bs, and Cs, and fewer received Ds, Fs, or withdrew, when taught by ACUE faculty, in research conducted by ACUE and Delta State.
- **Grades up at nation’s most diverse campus:** At Rutgers University-Newark, students were significantly more likely to earn an A, B, or C in courses taught by ACUE-credentialed faculty, compared to matched faculty. The findings from Rutgers University–Newark, among the most diverse universities in the country according to U.S. News & World Report, indicate that effective instruction is an important factor for achieving greater equity.⁷ This study was conducted in conjunction with the Center for Advanced Study of Education (CASE) at The Graduate Center at City University of New York.

⁴<http://www.crlt.umich.edu/research-basis-inclusive-teaching>, (retrieved January 15, 2020).

⁵“ACUE Student, Faculty, and Institutional Impact Research: Independent Review Process and Findings,” Association of College and University Educators, New York, NY, 2019. Retrieval at: <https://acue.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/06/ACUE-Research-Review-Findings-2019.pdf>; <https://acue.org/impact/efficacy-studies-reports/>

⁶ McAdams, C. “Opinion: Here’s a novel way to keep students in college: good teaching,” *Hechinger Report*, September 13, 2018, <https://hechingerreport.org/opinion-heres-a-novel-way-keep-students-in-college-good-teaching/>.

⁷Rutgers-Newark Tabbed ‘Most Diverse’ by Best Value Colleges, June 2018, <https://rutgersnewarkathletics.com/news/2018/6/13/baseball-rutgers-newark-tabbed-most-diverse-by-best-value-colleges.aspx>

- **Improved learning—with equity focus:** Average grades improved across 150 classes, enrolling more than 4,500 students, taught by ACUE-credentialed faculty at City College of San Francisco (CCSF). The project was funded by CCSF’s Office of Student Equity. Faculty recruitment focused on courses with achievement gaps for students at risk of dropping out, underrepresented minorities, foster children, and non-traditional or returning students.
- **Success rate doubled:** At Northern Arizona University (NAU), ACUE-credentialed faculty led the transformation of Bio 181—from “weed out” class to success story; DFW rates have dropped by 50%, in analysis provided by NAU.

Independent Research Review and Validation

ACUE’s research has been independently reviewed and validated by a panel of experts in higher education research, evaluation, policy and faculty development. Evaluators noted that ACUE’s studies constitute “an impressive body of work” that “reinforce[s] the link between faculty development, teaching improvement, and student learning” and concluded that grades and completion rates “more likely went up because the faculty became better at teaching.” The committee’s full findings were published in the report ACUE Student, Faculty, and Institutional Impact Research: Independent Review Process and Findings. ACUE’s research briefs and technical papers are available at <https://acue.org/impact/efficacy-studies-reports/>.

Inclusive Teaching Principles and Practices: The ACUE Curriculum

The following table presents the alignment of the principles of inclusive teaching with specific teaching practices recommended in ACUE courses. The table demonstrates the high degree to which ACUE’s teaching competencies, as defined in its Effective Practice Framework[®], prepare faculty to implement evidence-based approaches that create an inclusive learning environment that results in equitable outcomes.

<p style="text-align: center;">Inclusive Teaching Principle</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">ACUE Recommended Practices (organized by competencies defined in the ACUE Effective Practice Framework[®])</p>
<p>Inclusive Learning Objectives</p> <p>Inclusive student learning outcomes (SLOs) are clear and understandable to students, achievable for everyone (as much as possible), and reasonable given the timeframe and the resources provided to those taking your course. When drafting your SLOs, make sure that they fulfill all the characteristics of a SMART outcome. This means that your SLOs are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Specific ✓ Measurable/Meaningful ✓ Appropriate & Attainable ✓ Realistic & Time-framed <p>Well-written learning targets provide instructors with a structure for developing assessments that measure levels of learning. At the same time, good SLOs let students know what to expect in your course and how they must prepare to be successful in the area of study.</p> <p>When developing your SLOs, consider using the active verbs from Bloom’s Taxonomy (2001 version).</p> <p>Source: https://teaching.utk.edu/inclusiveteachingtoolbox/</p>	<p>Competency 1A: Establishing Powerful Learning Outcomes</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are student-centered (1A) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Describe the work, including the development of digital literacy skills, that students will be expected to do • Are observable and actionable (1A) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Ensure that students can demonstrate mastery ✓ Ensure that online students can demonstrate mastery of concepts, utilizing digital skills when appropriate • Are specific (1A) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Help students direct and focus their efforts ✓ Help online students direct and focus their efforts, utilizing digital skills when appropriate • Include a range of cognitive levels appropriate to your course (1A) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Encourage and build toward higher order thinking

Inclusive Assessments & Activities

Culturally responsive teaching “involves checking for mastery of student learning outcomes in a way that takes into consideration students’ cognitive, cultural and interdisciplinary diversity” (Ladson-Billings, 1994). Providing students with equitable learning opportunities builds trust, enhances your rapport with the learners in your classroom and, consequently, improves student motivation (Weimer, 2010).

- Be explicit about your assessment criteria and how they relate to learning goals, and share successful examples
- Think beyond tests and papers; give students multiple ways and repeated opportunities to reflect upon and demonstrate their learning and growth
- Create low-stakes opportunities for students to practice before they are asked to perform

Source:

<https://commons.georgetown.edu/teaching/static/files/inclusive-pedagogy-pamphlet.pdf>

Competency 1B: Aligning Assessments with Course Outcomes

- ✓ Select the types of paper-based and digital assessments that are aligned to the cognitive level(s) of your learning outcomes (1B)
- ✓ Develop and use assessment blueprints in your face-to-face, online, or hybrid course (1B)
- ✓ Develop and use course assessment plans in your face-to-face, online, or hybrid course (1B)
- ✓ Seek feedback from colleagues (1B)

Competency 1C: Aligning Activities and Assignments with Course Outcomes

- ✓ Plan for in- and out-of-class time (1C)
- ✓ Design transparent assignments aligned to learning outcomes (1C)
- ✓ Make your online course design and expectations transparent (1C)

Competency 2D: Motivating Your Students

- ✓ Vary and offer rationale for assessment types (2D)
- ✓ Vary and offer rationale for presentation methods (2D)
- ✓ Vary and offer rationale for presentation methods (2D)
- ✓ Incentivize assignment completion(2D)

Inclusive Grading & Assessment

In considering how to evaluate students' work, inclusive teaching considers that learners come to class with varying degrees of development in areas such as time management and study skills. Students' life situations also vary. Some may be working full-time to support families, raising their own children while attending college, managing mental health issues. First generation students may lack support in navigating college in general. Providing some flexibility in assignment structure and due dates can be helpful for all students. Ideas to consider:

- Consider dropping the lowest test or quiz grades
- Allow students to redo assignments to improve their scores
- Give students the opportunity to do test corrections to earn some partial credit on questions they missed
- Allow one late assignment per semester – no questions asked

Source:

<https://teaching.utk.edu/inclusiveteachingtoolbox/>

Strategies for Inclusive Feedback and Grading Use rubrics for inclusive grading

- Peer evaluation
- Student self-evaluation

Source: Columbia University Inclusive Teaching Course

Competency 2E: Engaging Underprepared Students

- Implement grading practices that support student success (2E)
 - ✓ Provide multiple opportunities to earn course points
 - ✓ Provide opportunities to use feedback to improve performance
 - ✓ Use online rubrics for students to examine their own performance

Competency 5A: Develop Fair, Consistent, and Transparent Grading Practices

- Set grading policies (5A)
 - ✓ Recognize improvement
 - ✓ Establish extra-credit opportunities
 - ✓ Set policies for handling late assignments

Competency 4E: Developing Self-Directed Learners

- Provide students with opportunities to self-assess their work and process (4E)
 - ✓ Use checklists and rubrics to facilitate self-and peer assessments (4E)
 - ✓ Integrate a structured peer review into projects and papers (4E)
 - ✓ Use exam wrappers or cognitive wrappers to prompt student reflection

<p>Inclusive Course Content</p> <p>Promote diversity and inclusion through course content and course design.</p>	<p>Competency 2G: Embracing Diversity</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Ensure your course is representative of diverse students and reflects a diverse society (2G) ✓ Ensure your online course visually reflects a diverse society (2G)
<p>Inclusive Syllabus</p> <p>A class syllabus is not only a record of assignments and activities; it is also a representation of who we are as instructors and the goals and ideals we wish to share with our students. The policies we choose to include in our syllabus – and the way we frame required policies – reflect our values and convey to students how we see them as learners and citizens in our classroom.</p> <p>Source: https://sites.lsa.umich.edu/inclusive-teaching/2017/08/24/inclusive-syllabus-language/</p> <p>A syllabus is often the first exposure students have to a course and instructor. The syllabus is more than the road map of a course. It is also a reflection of the instructor. What is included and excluded in a syllabus sends explicit messages to students about what an instructor values. Developing an inclusive syllabus is a key first step towards creating an inclusive classroom environment.</p> <p>Source: https://ctle.utah.edu/inclusiveteaching/syllabus.php</p>	<p>Competency 1D: Preparing an Effective Syllabus</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Use a checklist to verify that all essential items for classroom and/or online course expectations are included (1D) ✓ Create a calendar outlining important dates (1D) ✓ Build a graphic or big ideas syllabus (1D) ✓ Ensure a student focus (use student-friendly language, guiding questions, and key resources) (1D) ✓ Use student feedback for continuous improvement (1D) ✓ Include appropriate additions and detail for an online syllabus (1D) <p>Competency 2G: Embracing Diversity</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensure your syllabus sets the tone for diversity and inclusion (2G) by including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ A syllabus diversity statement. ✓ Expectations for valuing differences through respectful dialogue ✓ Policies, statements, and/or resource information that address the needs and concerns of all of your students.

Inclusive Task Instructions

Create a safe and effective learning environment for students by clearly describing task expectations to help ensure student understanding.

Source: http://digitalpromise.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/mc_asu_cleardirections.pdf

Competency 4A: Providing Clear Directions and Explanations

- ✓ Explain the purpose of the activity or assignment (4A)
- ✓ Break directions into appropriate steps (4A)
- ✓ Provide written directions (4A)
- ✓ Model the activity in class (4A)
- ✓ Create a video to provide complex directions online (4A)
- ✓ Provide organizational cues (forecast, highlight, signal transitions, repeat) (4A)
- ✓ Appropriately pace information (4A)
- ✓ Ensure vocabulary is accessible (4A)
- ✓ Include multiple examples (4A)
- ✓ Create a video explaining complex content online (4A)
- ✓ Provide worked examples (4A)
- ✓ Integrate visuals (diagrams, videos, pictures, etc.) (4A)
- ✓ Use a class or online activity reaction survey (4A)

Inclusive Learning Environment

Inclusive teaching involves creating a learning atmosphere that is accessible and meaningful for all.

Source: <https://commons.georgetown.edu/teaching/static/files/inclusive-pedagogy-pamphlet.pdf>

Students who feel comfortable in a classroom and who have some positive rapport with the teacher are likely to have better learning outcomes. In one Indiana University study, students reported that one important condition of their achievement in class is that they feel their instructor “cares about them.” In the long run, an instructor will accomplish more learning by spending some time, especially in the first few classes, on creating a supportive environment by such actions as learning student names, smiling, and making encouraging statements to the class.

Source: <https://citl.indiana.edu/teaching-resources/diversity-inclusion/encouraging-civility/index.html>

Source: Columbia University Inclusive Teaching Course

Create opportunities for students to build rapport with each other and with you at the beginning of and throughout the semester

Competency 2A: Leading the First Day of Class

- ✓ Greet students as they walk into the classroom (2A)
- ✓ Use an icebreaker (2A)
- ✓ Post a personal introduction(2A)
- ✓ Create an online introduction discussion forum
- ✓ Use a reciprocal interview (2A)
- ✓ Assign a syllabus activity (2A)
- ✓ Create an online profile to help your students get to know you (2A)

Competency 2D: Motivating Your Students

- ✓ Discuss or create a video describing your interest and background in the discipline (2D)

<p>Invest in getting to know your students as individuals rather than as representatives for entire groups</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Share the relevance of your course content to students' academic and career goals (2D)
<p>Gather and respond to anonymous student feedback (on teaching techniques, comfort level, classroom experiences, etc.) throughout the semester</p>	<p>Competency 2A: Leading the First Day of Class</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Allow students to pose questions anonymously (2A) <p>Competency 5E: Using Student Data and Feedback to Improve Your Teaching</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Use Stop-Start-Continue, Small-Group Instructional Diagnosis, and Point-of-View Postcards (5E)
<p>Learn and use students' names when communicating</p>	<p>Competency 2D: Motivating Your Students</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Get to know your students by name (take roll, use seating charts, name tents, introduction posts, and photos) (2D)
<p>Create opportunities for collaborative learning</p>	<p>Competency 3A: Using Groups to Ensure Active Learning</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Plan for the effective use of active learning techniques (3A) ✓ Share the aim and rationale with students (3A) ✓ Ensure accountability (3A) ✓ Debrief with students (3A) <p>Competency 3C: Developing Effective Class Sessions and Lectures</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Segment class with active learning techniques (3C) ✓ Use activities to check for understanding

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Design mini-lessons for each complex idea or topic ✓ Use the “I do, we do, you do” model
<p>Provide opportunities for students to interact with you and one another</p>	<p>Competency 2E: Engaging Underprepared Students</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Provide a student-only online chat room or discussion forum (2C) ✓ Hold group office hours (2C) ✓ Encourage student-to-student support; create an online Buddy System ✓ Provide resources for students (2E) <p>Competency 2F: Helping Students Persist in their Studies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Establish peer-to-peer support (2F)
<p>Plan discussion prompts that take into consideration learners’ backgrounds, perspectives and values.</p>	<p>Competency 3D: Planning an Effective Class Discussion</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Create thought-provoking questions (3D) ✓ Set expectations for student participation (3D) ✓ Use space or online communication tools to increase student-to-student interaction (3D) ✓ Ensure students are prepared for class (3D)
<p>Include a civility statement in the syllabus that addresses specific expectations for student behavior, interaction, and communication</p>	<p>Competency 2B: Promoting a Civil Learning Environment</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Write policies and set expectations that encourage civility in the classroom or in the online course environment (2B) ✓ Set clear policies regarding incivility in your syllabus (2B) ✓ Include netiquette guidelines in your syllabus (2B)

<p>At the start of a semester, establish community norms by having students identify and discuss their own expectations for respectful engagement and civil discourse in the online environment. Create course policies around these expectations. Hold students accountable – and have students hold one another accountable – when these policies are not followed.</p>	<p>Competency 2B: Promoting a Civil Learning Environment</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Work with students to create classroom or online norms (2B) <p>Competency 2G: Embracing Diversity</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Set ground rules for maintaining productive discourse in the classroom or online (2G)
<p>Understand the impact of Stereotype Threat and Microaggressions on Student Learning and Belonging</p>	<p>Competency 2G: Embracing Diversity</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Understand the impact of microaggressions and use language to validate student identities (2G) ✓ Understand the impact of stereotype threat and mitigate its effects (2G)

<p>Unearth your assumptions, examine your biases about students.</p> <p>Source: Linking Implicit Bias to Classroom Teaching Practices (S. Brookfield)</p> <p>In a teaching and learning context, implicit bias presents a serious barrier to leveraging the benefits of a heterogeneous learning space in which students feel welcomed and validated. Therefore, it is important that instructors do the difficult work of self-examination to determine what their biases are and how to work against them. Once these biases have been identified, it is up to them to challenge those notions and move towards a more open approach to learning and appreciating cultural differences. Given the deep impact that bias can have on one’s perspective of others, this process is ongoing – even lifelong! – and requires a commitment to developing cultural competency and an attitude of humility in interactions with culturally different others.</p> <p>Source: https://teaching.utk.edu/inclusiveteachingtoolbox/</p>	<p>Competency 2G: Embracing Diversity</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Examine how your background and experiences have shaped your perspective of your own and others’ cultural identity by (2G) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Taking one of Harvard’s Implicit Association Tests ○ Using the four questions from Center for the Integration of Research, Teaching, and Learning (CIRTL) for self-reflection
<p>Address Challenging Moments Head-On</p>	<p>Competency 2G Embracing Diversity</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Manage disruptions and "hot moments" in the classroom or online environment (2G) <p>Competency 2B: Promoting a Civil Learning Environment</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Respond to varied levels of student behavior (2B)

<p>Cultivate a Growth Mindset</p>	<p>Competency 2F: Helping Students Persist in their Studies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Focus on learning (2F) ✓ Connect study habits to performance (2F) <p>Competency 2D: Motivating Your Students</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Teach students to set goals they are likely to achieve(2D) ✓ Set reasonable, high expectations(2D) <p>Competency 4E: Developing Self-Directed Learners</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Build student understanding about their learning strengths and preferences (4E) ✓ Use cues to help students build a growth mindset (4E) ✓ Provide opportunities for students to practice decision-making (4E)
<p>Provide additional support</p>	<p>Competency 2E: Engaging Underprepared Students</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Provide resources for students to improve their skills (2F) ✓ Assist students in using campus or online resources for academic support (2F)